

Dasam Granth Dispute Resolution

By

Mewa Singh Rtd. Judge California-USA

DASAM GRANTH, CONTAINS THE COMPOSITIONS, JAAP SAHIB, AKAL USTAT, BACHITTER NATAK, CoNTAINING-:" CHANDI CHARITER 1 AND 11, CHANDI DI VAR, GIAN PARBODH, CHAUBIS AVTAR, UP AVTARS ", SHABAD HAZARE, 33 SAWYAS, KHALSA MEHMA, SHASTER NAM MALA PURAN, CHARITRO PAKHYAN, ZAFAR NAMA AND HIKAYATs.

ALL THESE COMPOSITION ARE INDEPENDANT AND SEPERATE, BUT COMBINED TOGETHER, CALLED DASAM GRANTH. ADMITTEDLY THIS COMBINATION WAS NOT DONE BY GURU GOBIND SINGH.

ITS SUPPORTERS ATTRIBUTE IT TO BHAJ MANI SINGH, WHILE ITS OPPONENETS FALSIFY IT.

Practically all Sikhs and Sikh scholars admit that- Jaap sahib, Akal ustat(except Chhand 201-230), shabad hazare, 33 sawyas, khalsa mehma,and zafar nama, are the compositions of Guru Gobind Singh, being in accordance with the Divine thought of Sikh religion. Some of these compositions are a part of Sikh nit nem and Sikh initiation- Amrit as contained in Sikh rehat maryada, a collective Sikh decision, to be followed by all Sikhs.

The dispute is as to other compositions, that these are in contradiction to the the Divine teaching of Sikh religion. Sikh panth has not taken any decision in this regard, being post poned since long, which needs to be taken in accordance with the Sikh concept of Guru Grnth-Guru panth,to be acceptable to all.

Guru Gobind Singh ordained the Sikhs to accept Guru Granth Sahib as the perpetual eternal Guru of Sikhs, which contains the revealed word of God. It completely rejects the Gods and Goddess of Hinduism and their reincarnations and the worship of Idols. Guru Granth Sahib preaches the Name of God (one and only one, formless, unborn and self illuminated) to be imbued in one's mind. If any composition violates these fundamentals of Sikhism and praises any Hindu God, Goddess or their incarnations, it can never be of any Sikh Guru or even of any true follower of Sikhism. Guru Granth Sahib is such a true guide that it is not at all difficult to come to the true conclusion in this respect. It requires a very serious thought that whether the compositions relating to the praise and admiration of Goddess Durga, Ram Chandra or Sri Krishna or any other Hindu God can, ever be attributed to Guru Gobind Singh.

American scholar Geoffrey Parinder who authored the book, 'World Religions' could find no difficulty to conclude at page 259-"The Dasam Granth is an eighteenth century collection of miscellaneous works attributed to Guru Gobind Singh. The attribution appears to be accurate in the case of few compositions, but the bulk of the collection, consisting of Hindu legends and tales of the wiles of women can not possibly have been his work."

Several other scholars of Sikh religion have also come to the same conclusion, while some differed to it. Guru Gobind Singh in his divine hymns totally rejected all Hindu Gods, scriptures, rites and rituals and the Hindu Caste System. Instead Guru Gobind Singh created a separate Sikh identity to complete the formation of Sikh nation. The Sikh nation was made so independent and powerful that it established a sovereign Sikh empire through out north India.

Some Hindu fundamentalists have alleged Sikh religion to be part of Hinduism on the ground of placing and reciting Dasam Granth in two Sikh Takhata at Hazur Sahib and Patna Sahib, containing translations of Hindu Legends and incarnations, attributed to Guru Gobind Singh. It is a self-deception to take advantage of the dishonest interpolation of the Hindu legends in the Dasam Granth.

The real compositions of the great Guru rather prove to the otherwise, without any shadow of doubt, that Sikh religion is an independent separate religion with its distinct identity, religious practices and unique doctrines and ideology. In fact it is the great Guru's prescribed identity and the code of conduct that always stood as a rock to fail the futile exercises of some Hindu fundamentalists to falsely misrepresent Sikhs to be part of Hindus time and again.

Guru Gobind Singh was very outspoken to totally reject the Hindu Gods and Goddesses. In his Divine compositions he proclaimed--
God has no incarnation. Ye say that God is unconceived and unborn.
How could he be from the womb of Kausalya, (Ram Chandra)
If he whom we call Krishna were God, why was he subject to death?
Why was God whom ye describe as holy and without enmity have driven
Arjan's chariot. Worship as God Him whose secrets none hath known or shall
know.

Thirty three Sawayas--X111

and

Some worship Brahma as God, others point to Shiva as God.
Some say that Vishnu is the Lord of the world and that by
worshiping him all sins are erased.

Think on this a thousand times,,o fool. At the last hour
all thy Gods will forsake thee.

Meditate on Him in thy heart, who was and ever shall be.

Thirty three Sawayas--XV1

It needs logical thought that whether still Guru Gobind Singh can be connected to the compositions relating to the Hindu legends and their translations from purans and Shastras of Hinduism containing the praises of Hindu gods and Goddesses as contained in the Dasam Granth, which are in total contradiction to the dictums of Sikh religion and to the stories as to tales of wiles of women, some of which downgrade their dignity and are obviously obscene, besides depicting the use of intoxicants, forbidden in Sikh religion.

Misconception and confusion in some Sikhs in this regard needs to be removed with education to the right perspective, by those who have the correct understanding , telling them the motivations and making it clear to them that the hand behind such confusions may be of those who propagate that Sikh religion is part of Hinduism and Sikhs are a sect of Hindus and who support it from the recitations of the compositions of this Granth in Sikh Takhats.

Those who are opponents of this Dasam Granth should understand and themselves be clear that the Divine compositions which are included in Sikh Nit nem and for the preparation of Amrit-Khande de pahul as contained in Sikh Rehat maryada to be of Guru Gobind Singh are of his. In fact the procedure prescribed by him for Amrit is the same which is now followed. It was not any secret thing and was known to thousands of Sikhs who were present there. Several persons who took the Amrit from Guru Gobind Singh or under his guidance were the leaders in Sikh struggle and they themselves imparted the Amrit to thousands of Sikhs and such a process continued uptill now. No one could dare to change it. It is no where even alleged that when, who and why the original prescribed procedure was changed.

Some contradictory writings are cited in this regard, which itself shows that those writers knew not the reality and did no research about it and only followed the stray remarks of those, who were ignorant themselves about it. Such contradictory writings have to be ignored. There were also the conspiracies and motivations to create confusions by the anti Sikh forces, who were motivated to bring in Sikh religion, the same myths, superstitions and the Hindu Gods and incarnations and their worship, rejected by Sikh Gurus and those elements who could never reconcile to the order of Khalsa, Sikh code of conduct, Sikh initiation of Amrit and separate Sikh identity, which are still in existence and active up till now. The writers who were and are under confusion in this regard, are not aware to the correct Sikh historical perspectives.

The Bani of Guru Gobind Singh, of course the real one, is Gurbani, as it was composed by him when he was the tenth Sikh Guru, though not included in Guru Granth Sahib. Some of his divine compositions are part of Nit Nem and Sikh innitiation- Amrit, as contained in Sikh rehat maryada, the collective Sikh panth decision, which must be accepted by all Sikhs.

It is for the Sikhs to take the collective decision through their representatives about

Dasam Granth and its compositions. Those compositions, which are not his, should not be attributed to Guru Gobind Singh, while his real compositions should be revered as Gurbani.

In Dasam Granth, the real Divine compositions only of Guru Gobind Singh should be kept as above referred to and any other as decided by Sikh Panth to be his, to have been interpolated and inter mixed elsewhere, for which the deep study is required and particularly of the first part of Bachitter Natak, where in his past and present life, his mission, commandments of God to him and his battles with hill chiefs and Mughal army, have been described in the personal tense. All other compositions should remain separate as these originally were. Bachitter Natak is a separate composition and so are Shaster Nam Mala, Charitro Pakhyan and Hakayats 2 to 12. In fact all these were clubbed together with the other real compositions of the great Guru without any authority and logic, which needs to be undone.

Supporters of the Dasam Granth allege that it was so done by Bhai Mani Singh after about two decades of the heavenly abode of Tenth Guru, but some scholars falsify this version. Admittedly Guru Gobind Singh had not done it. Even if for the sake of argument, it is admitted that Bhai Mani Singh did it, then the question arises that, What right Bhai Mani Singh had to do so. Any Sikh, whatever esteem and respect, he may command in Sikhs, can have no right to act as Guru or Sikh Panth. Such a Panthic decision can not be taken by him as only Panth has the right to take such Panthic decisions, which has not so far been taken by Sikh Panth on this issue.

Though Sikhs have not taken any direct collective decision on Dasam Granth, but no recognition to it has been given, excepting to the Divine compositions of Guru Gobind Singh, just as Jaap Sahib, Sawyas and Chaupai in Sikh Rehat Maryada, making it part of Nit Nem and Sikh Initiation- Amrit. It has been provided in Sikh Rehat Maryada that-

”No other book, however holy and readable, is to be installed in a Gurdawara as the holy Guru Granth Sahib is installed.”

It obviously means that Dasam Granth can not be installed in a Gurdawara, where in only Guru Granth Sahib can be installed. The usual order of services in a Gurdawara has been provided-

The usual order of services performed in a Gurdawara is the Opening of Holy Guru Granth Sahib, Kirtan, Exposition, Gurbani Katha, the Anand, the prayer, the reading of a passage from the Holy Guru Granth Sahib, the distribution of Karah Parsad, and dispersal.

It obviously means that no Dasam Granth there and no reading of passage from it in Gurdawaras.

The exposition of the holy word (Guru Granth Sahib) alone is allowed in a Gurdawara. It means no exposition from dasam granth is allowed in a Gurdawara. And The Amrit ceremony is to be held in the presence of holy Guru Granth Sahib and a passage only from it is to be read. It obviously means no dasam granth can be taken there and no passage from it to be read.

In fact all the Sikhs admit that only Guru Granth Sahib is the eternal Sikh Guru in perpetuity as ordained by Guru Gobind Singh. Installation of dasam granth in Gurdawaras is not permissible and neither the reading of passage from it, as it can not be given the status equal to Guru Granth Sahib, besides the open violation of Sikh rehat maryada. As these violations are taking place and some Sikhs accept all the compositions of dasam granth and some reject all its compositions, under their own misunderstandings, a decision should be taken by Sikh panth to its right perspective under the Divine guidance of Guru Granth Sahib in the form of Gurmatta, to be acceptable to all the Sikhs.

The concept of Guru Granth-Guru panth, as ordained by Guru Gobind Singh, should be revived, the ignorance of which for a long time has incapacitated the Sikhs to take the collective decisions as to the Sikh panthic affairs. It has been reiterated in sikh rehat maryada as well, that all the decisions affecting the Sikh panth should be taken by the panthic committee and the accredited representatives of the panth form a meeting of the panth and their decision is called Gurmatta, to be taken in the presence and Divine guidance of Guru Granth Sahib, on the subjects which are calculated to clarify and support the fundamental principles of Sikh religion, such as safeguarding the position of Sikh Gurus and the holy Guru Granth Sahib, the purity of the ritual and the panthic organization. The decisions of the panth are to be inviolable and binding on all Sikhs. The Sikh panthic decisions were taken in this manner at Akal Takhat by the Sikhs during the Sikh struggle in 18th century and they became victorious to wipe out the mughals and Afgan invaders and to establish Sikh empire.

Sikhs are now spread world over and a commission of experts may be appointed to set up a panthic committee as Sikh representative to take the decisions on Sikh affairs as the involvement of all the Sikh is a must to make the decisions to be acceptable to all. The blue print may be to take the representatives of the organizations elected by the Sikhs, just as SGPC, management committees of Delhi Gurdawaras, Sikh Takhats at Hazoor Sahib, Patna Sahib, other traditional Sikh organizations, world Sikh Gurdawars management committees, to be divided in 6 or 7 zones on the basis of population and any other Sikh organization elected by the Sikhs. The number of the representatives of these organizations may be fixed according to the number of Sikhs, they represent. These representatives may co-opt the distinguished Sikhs known for their services to Sikh panth as fixed, world over.

This panthic representative committee should hold its meetings and Sikh congregations at Akal Takhat Amritsar and have its secretariate in that complex.

The Akal Takhat Jathedar should be its spokesman and to ensure the compliance of its decisions, to be nominated by it. The authority of Akal Takhat, which is now being eroded, will be restored and its sanctity maintained. It can also preach Sikh religion world over, as to which Sikhs are being accused by world scholars of religions, of not discharging their duties in this regard. It may also bring in, all Sikhs, particularly the Sikh youth, in Sikh code of conduct and Sikh way of life, from which they are drifting away.

Let the first task of this representative panthic committee be to settle the Dasam Granth dispute to the expectations of Sikhs and acceptable to all, under the Divine guidance of Guru Granth Sahib. A Sikh representative meeting may be called at Akal Takhat immediately and it may set up a commission of experts to deeply go through this matter, to discuss it with the persons holding different views, to hold their interse discussions, to bring them to the right perspective and then to submit its report ,which may facilitate the right decision to be taken by the Sikh representative panthic committee, to be acceptable to all the Sikhs. This commission may also settle the procedural matters to set up the world Sikh representative panthic committee

The Sikhs holding different views on this issue should try to reconcile and not to accuse each other to be the agents of anti Sikh forces, as most of them consider them to be bonafide in their views, may be right or wrong or may be due to their misunderstanding of the issue. Moreover the agents of secret agencies are very few, to create only confusions and controversies, who are always difficult to be found out. However if the Sikhs holding different views on this issue do not see to the reason and logic to come to the correct unanimous decision , then they will certainly be helping the cause of anti Sikh forces to create division in the Sikhs on such a made up crucial issue.

Opinion on Dasam Granth Prosecution

By

Mewa Singh Rtd. Judge California-USA

I have been asked by some persons to give my views about the propaganda of prosecutions as to dasam granth compositions. I have already given my views that the dispute as to dasam granth should be amicably resolved by Sikh panth itself ,the details of which are contained in my earlier post,so as not to create, any doubts as to Sikh Divine thought and any division in Sikhs on this issue.

I refrained not to give my comments as to the issue of the prosecutions in this matter as alleged by some persons,as it is the free will of every one to prosecute the other ,if he thinks that he has committed an offence, to which he can legally prosecute. The person prosecuted has got the legal remedy to prosecute the prosecutor and claim

damages, if the prosecution is held to be malicious and without reasonable cause.

So let the persons who want to try this venture, have the taste of the court procedure and its results themselves ,which may prove to be neither in their interest and nor in Sikh interests.